

**Date:** Monday 13 November 2023 at 2.00 pm

**Venue:** Jim Cooke Conference Suite, Stockton Central Library, Stockton - on - Tees,  
TS18 1TU

**Cllr Richard Eglington (Chair)**  
**Cllr Katie Weston (Vice-Chair)**

Cllr Michelle Bendelow  
Cllr Stefan Houghton  
Cllr Marilyn Surtees  
Cllr Alan Watson

Cllr Ray Godwin  
Cllr Andrew Sherris  
Cllr Hilary Vickers

## **AGENDA**

- 1 Evacuation Procedure** (Pages 7 - 8)
- 2 Apologies for Absence**
- 3 Declarations of Interest**
- 4 Minutes**  
  
To approve the minutes of the last meeting held on 9 October 2023 (Pages 9 - 12)
- 5 Monitoring of Previously Agreed Recommendations: Progress Update - Scrutiny Review of Highways Asset Management (including Potholes and Flooding)** (Pages 13 - 18)
- 6 Scrutiny Review of Domestic Waste Collections, Kerbside Recycling and Green Waste**  
  
To receive a presentation from a representative from the Waste and Resources Action Programme (WRAP). (To follow)
- 7 Chair's Update and Select Committee Work Programme 2023 - 2024** (Pages 19 - 20)
- 8 Exclusion of the Public**

RECOMMENDED that under Section 100A of Part 1 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972, the press & public be excluded from the meeting on the grounds that it is likely to discuss exempt information as defined in Paragraph 3 of the Act.

**9 Scrutiny Review of Domestic Waste Collections,  
Kerbside Recycling and Green Waste**

To receive a verbal update from Council Officers and a representative from the Waste and Resources Action Programme (WRAP).

**Members of the Public - Rights to Attend Meeting**

With the exception of any item identified above as containing exempt or confidential information under the Local Government Act 1972 Section 100A(4), members of the public are entitled to attend this meeting and/or have access to the agenda papers.

Persons wishing to obtain any further information on this meeting, including the opportunities available for any member of the public to speak at the meeting; or for details of access to the meeting for disabled people, please

Contact: Scrutiny Support Officer Rachel Harrison on email [rachel.harrison@stockton.gov.uk](mailto:rachel.harrison@stockton.gov.uk)

**KEY - Declarable interests are:-**

- Disclosable Pecuniary Interests (DPI's)
- Other Registerable Interests (ORI's)
- Non Registerable Interests (NRI's)

**Members – Declaration of Interest Guidance**



**Table 1 - Disclosable Pecuniary Interests**

<b>Subject</b>	<b>Description</b>
<b>Employment, office, trade, profession or vocation</b>	Any employment, office, trade, profession or vocation carried on for profit or gain
<b>Sponsorship</b>	Any payment or provision of any other financial benefit (other than from the council) made to the councillor during the previous 12-month period for expenses incurred by him/her in carrying out his/her duties as a councillor, or towards his/her election expenses. This includes any payment or financial benefit from a trade union within the meaning of the Trade Union and Labour Relations (Consolidation) Act 1992.
<b>Contracts</b>	Any contract made between the councillor or his/her spouse or civil partner or the person with whom the councillor is living as if they were spouses/civil partners (or a firm in which such person is a partner, or an incorporated body of which such person is a director* or a body that such person has a beneficial interest in the securities of*) and the council — (a) under which goods or services are to be provided or works are to be executed; and (b) which has not been fully discharged.
<b>Land and property</b>	Any beneficial interest in land which is within the area of the council. 'Land' excludes an easement, servitude, interest or right in or over land which does not give the councillor or his/her spouse or civil partner or the person with whom the councillor is living as if they were spouses/ civil partners (alone or jointly with another) a right to occupy or to receive income.
<b>Licences</b>	Any licence (alone or jointly with others) to occupy land in the area of the council for a month or longer.
<b>Corporate tenancies</b>	Any tenancy where (to the councillor's knowledge)— (a) the landlord is the council; and (b) the tenant is a body that the councillor, or his/her spouse or civil partner or the person with whom the councillor is living as if they were spouses/ civil partners is a partner of or a director* of or has a beneficial interest in the securities* of.
<b>Securities</b>	Any beneficial interest in securities* of a body where— (a) that body (to the councillor's knowledge) has a place of business or land in the area of the council; and (b) either— (i) the total nominal value of the securities* exceeds £25,000 or one hundredth of the total issued share capital of that body; or (ii) if the share capital of that body is of more than one class, the total nominal value of the shares of any one class in which the councillor, or his/ her spouse or civil partner or the person with whom the councillor is living as if they were spouses/civil partners have a beneficial interest exceeds one hundredth of the total issued share capital of that class.

\* 'director' includes a member of the committee of management of an industrial and provident society.

\* 'securities' means shares, debentures, debenture stock, loan stock, bonds, units of a collective investment scheme within the meaning of the Financial Services and Markets Act 2000 and other securities of any description, other than money deposited with a building society.

## Table 2 – Other Registerable Interest

You must register as an Other Registrable Interest:

- a) any unpaid directorships
- b) any body of which you are a member or are in a position of general control or management and to which you are nominated or appointed by your authority
- c) any body
  - (i) exercising functions of a public nature
  - (ii) directed to charitable purposes or
  - (iii) one of whose principal purposes includes the influence of public opinion or policy (including any political party or trade union) of which you are a member or in a position of general control or management

## **Jim Cooke Conference Suite, Stockton Central Library** **Evacuation Procedure & Housekeeping**

If the fire or bomb alarm should sound please exit by the nearest emergency exit. The Fire alarm is a continuous ring and the Bomb alarm is the same as the fire alarm however it is an intermittent ring.

If the Fire Alarm rings exit through the nearest available emergency exit and form up in Municipal Buildings Car Park.

The assembly point for everyone if the Bomb alarm is sounded is the car park at the rear of Splash on Church Road.

The emergency exits are located via the doors between the 2 projector screens. The key coded emergency exit door will automatically disengage when the alarm sounds.

The Toilets are located on the Ground floor corridor of Municipal Buildings next to the emergency exit. Both the ladies and gents toilets are located on the right hand side.

### **Microphones**

During the meeting, members of the Committee, and officers in attendance, will have access to a microphone. Please use the microphones, when directed to speak by the Chair, to ensure you are heard by the Committee.

This page is intentionally left blank



## PLACE SELECT COMMITTEE

A meeting of Place Select Committee was held on Monday 9 October 2023.

**Present:** Cllr Richard Eglington (Chair), Cllr Katie Weston (Vice-Chair), Cllr Michelle Bendelow, Cllr Stefan Houghton, Cllr Andrew Sherris, Cllr Marilyn Surtees, Cllr Hilary Vickers, Cllr Sylvia Walmsley (sub for Cllr Ray Godwin) and Cllr Sally Ann Watson (sub for Cllr Alan Watson).

**Officers:** Abigail Kiddell, Dale Rowbotham, Edward Tannahill, Craig Willows (CS, E&C) and Rebecca Saunders-Thompson (CS).

**Also in attendance:** Mike Gardner (WRAP)

**Apologies:** Cllr Ray Godwin and Cllr Alan Watson.

### **PLA/12/23 Evacuation Procedure**

The Committee noted the evacuation and housekeeping procedure.

### **PLA/13/23 Declarations of Interest**

There were no declarations of interest.

### **PLA/14/23 Minutes**

AGREED the minutes of the meeting held on 11 September 2023 be confirmed as a correct record and signed by the Chair.

### **PLA/15/23 Scrutiny Review of Domestic Waste Collections, Kerbside Recycling and Green Waste**

The Select Committee received a presentation on M.E.L Research analysis of waste and recycling in Stockton-on-Tees from the review's link officer, which included:

- M.E.L Waste Analysis
- Composition of Residual Waste
- Participation Rates
- Food Waste

The Select Committee received a presentation on waste and recycling in Stockton-on-Tees, from a Local Authority Technical Consultant from the Waste and Resources Action Programme (WRAP), which included:

- WRAP Support to Stockton-on-Tees Borough Council (SBC)
- National Context
- Local Context
- Benchmarking Performance - comparing SBC's recycling and residual waste rates with WRAP 'nearest neighbour' Rurality Group 4 (suburban/ high deprivation) authorities

- Separate Food Waste Collections
- Refuse Collection Frequency over Time (% households in England) – data from 2010/11 – 2021/22
- Outline of 4 Alternative Collection Scenarios
- Assessment of Alternative Collection Scenarios
- Timeline for WRAP Modelling and Results Feedback

The main issues highlighted from the presentations and discussed were as follows:

- Following the coronavirus pandemic, waste composition had changed because of a change in buying habits. There was an increase in cardboard packaging disposal, due to an increase in online purchasing, and a decrease in paper disposal, due to a decrease in purchasing of printed newspapers.
- Members questioned if food waste would have to be collected separately. It was confirmed that this would be the case. It was added that the Environment Act 2021 stated that food waste was the only material to have a specified timeframe for collection.
- In terms of benchmarking, it was highlighted that SBC collected high quality recycling but only collected a low amount compared to other authorities. SBC also collected its residual waste more frequently than other Councils and provided residents with a larger bin. Barrow-in Furness Council was the only other Council within the Rurality Group 4 that collected residual waste weekly.
- Other local authorities had experienced a reduction in overall waste tonnage by reducing the capacity of residual waste bins (either by reducing the size of bins or the frequency of collections).
- Officers requested if a correlation between larger bin sizes and a larger amount of waste could be included in WRAP's analysis report. This was agreed.
- Members questioned if there had been an increase in fly tipping if bin sizes or frequency of collections were reduced. WRAP had researched this issue previously and could not find a clear link between an increase in fly tipping resulting from a decrease in the frequency of collection or size of bins. However, it was noted that fly tipping was reported through various channels, and this made it difficult to assess the situation fully.
- It was confirmed that three weekly collections would not be included in WRAP's scenario analysis of SBC's waste and recycling service.
- A discussion on green waste was held, and Members highlighted the problem of residents sometimes disposing of green waste in their 240l wheeled bins with residual waste. Further information on green waste would be provided by officers as part of this review.
- The option for additional residual waste bins for larger households was discussed.
- Discussions were held on the increase of recycling bins across the borough in town centre locations. It was hoped that the introduction of the Government's Deposit Return Scheme (DRS) would reduce levels of waste in street litter bins.
- At November's Committee meeting, analysis from WRAP's assessment of alternative collection scenarios would be presented.

The Committee requested the following further information:

AGREED that:

- 1) the information be noted.
- 2) the further information be provided as requested.

The Chair informed the Committee that a request had been received from a Member to move the meeting start time to 4pm and that any changes to meeting times would be effective from January 2024. The Committee agreed to move Committee meeting start times from 2pm to 4pm.

Consideration was given to the Work Programme.

The next meeting would be held on Monday 13 November 2023.

AGREED that the new Committee meeting start time (from January 2024) and the Work Programme be noted.

This page is intentionally left blank

**Agenda Item**

**Place Select Committee**

**13 November 2023**

## **PROGRESS UPDATES ON PREVIOUSLY AGREED RECOMMENDATIONS**

### **Summary**

Members are asked to consider the evidence and assessments of progress contained within the attached Progress Update on the implementation of previously agreed recommendations in relation to the review of Highways Asset Management (including Potholes & Flooding). The Committee’s final report can be accessed via the following link:

<https://moderngov.stockton.gov.uk/Data/Cabinet/202201201630/Agenda/att41985.pdf>

### **Detail**

1. Following the Cabinet consideration of scrutiny reports, accepted recommendations are then subject to a monitoring process to track their implementation.
2. Two main types of report are used. Initially this is by means of Action Plans detailing how services will be taking forward agreed recommendations. This is then followed by a Progress Update report approximately 12 months after the relevant Select Committee has agreed the Action Plan. Evidence is submitted by the relevant department together with an assessment of progress against all recommendations. Should members of the Select Committee agree, those recommendations which have reached an assessment of ‘1’ are then signed off as having been completed.
3. If any recommendations remain incomplete, or if the Select Committee does not agree with the view on progress, the Select Committee may ask for a further update.
4. The assessment of progress for each recommendation should be categorised as follows:

1	Achieved (Fully)	The evidence provided shows that the recommendation has been fully implemented within the timescale specified.
2	On Track (but not yet due for completion)	The evidence provided shows that implementation of the recommendation is on track but the timescale specified has not expired.
3	Slipped	The evidence shows that progress on

		<p>implementation has slipped.</p> <p>An anticipated date by which the recommendation is expected to become achieved should be advised and the reasons for the delay.</p>
4	Not Achieved	<p>The evidence provided shows that the recommendation has not been fully achieved.</p> <p>An explanation for non-achievement of the recommendation would be provided.</p>

5. For progress update reports following the completion of a review, the relevant Link Officer(s) will be in attendance.
6. **Appendix 1** (Review of Highways Asset Management (including Potholes & Flooding)) sets out the outstanding recommendations for this Committee. Members are asked to review the update and indicate whether they agree with the assessments of progress.

**Name of Contact Officer:** Rebecca Saunders-Thompson  
**Post Title:** Senior Scrutiny Officer  
**Telephone No:** 01642 528957  
**Email Address:** [Rebecca.Saunders-Thompson@stockton.gov.uk](mailto:Rebecca.Saunders-Thompson@stockton.gov.uk)

## APPENDIX 1

## PROGRESS UPDATE: Review of Highways Asset Management (inc. Potholes &amp; Flooding)

SCRUTINY MONITORING – PROGRESS UPDATE	
<b>Review:</b>	Review of Highways Asset Management (inc. Potholes & Flooding)
<b>Link Officer/s:</b>	Simon Milner/ Ian Raine
<b>Action Plan Agreed:</b>	February 2022

Updates on the progress of actions in relation to agreed recommendations from previous scrutiny reviews are required approximately 12 months after the relevant Select Committee has agreed the Action Plan. Progress updates must be detailed, evidencing what has taken place regarding each recommendation – a grade assessing progress should then be given (see end of document for grading explanation). Any evidence on the impact of the actions undertaken should also be recorded for each recommendation.

<b>Recommendation 2:</b>	<b>That options to ‘invest to save’ are explored and costs and returns are calculated.</b>
Responsibility:	HN&FRM & Highway Ops Team
Date:	July 2022
Agreed Action:	Liaise with operational teams to compile options reports and costings for consideration.
Agreed Success Measure:	Report produced with recommendations.
Evidence of Progress (February 2023):	<p>Initial options of new and innovative techniques have been explored, and these include:</p> <p>Roadmender – a proprietary vehicle borne method of using a flowable pothole filling material with minimal excavation requirements.</p> <p>Crack Sealing – a proprietary hot warm flow material for the filling of small defects and cracks within the uppermost surface layers of a road.</p> <p>Roadpatch MMA – a cold lay material for filling of potholes.</p> <p>Meon ECO ES Roadliner – an all-electric road marking machine for fast response to reactive road marking repairs.</p> <p>Meon Patchmaster – a cold lay material for filling potholes and other small scale defect repairs</p> <p>JCB Pothole Pro – self-contained machine for excavation and cleaning of predominantly large area defect repairs</p> <p>To date, trials of Roadmender and Crack Sealing have been carried out within the Borough.</p>

## APPENDIX 1

### PROGRESS UPDATE: Review of Highways Asset Management (inc. Potholes & Flooding)

Assessment of Progress (February 2023): (include explanation if required)	<p>3 – Slipped</p> <p>Due to resource issues within the highway construction sector, limited progress has been made on this action.</p>
Evidence of Impact (February 2023):	<p>Performance of the above-mentioned proprietary materials that have been trialled is ongoing in order to assess their longevity and reduced need for return visits.</p>
Evidence of Progress (November 2023):	<p>Roadmender – a further trial of this machine in different locations is planned for later in the year and its use will be evaluated going forward.</p> <p>Crack sealing has now been successfully used on a number of locations within the Borough, including Church Road, Portrack Lane and Blair Avenue. Further use is planned for the Marsh House Avenue area of Billingham in the next couple of weeks.</p> <p>Roadpatch MMA and Meon Patchmaster were costed out, but in comparison to existing cold lay materials there was insufficient evidence to suggest if the expected longevity of the material was sufficient to warrant its extra cost.</p> <p>Meon ECO ES Roadliner – this device is currently in use in Redcar and Cleveland Councils area, its effectiveness and use will be evaluated within their area and if successful we will explore the options to share its use with them.</p> <p>Other different ways of working / innovations being used within the Borough now include:</p> <p>Velocity patching – a vehicle borne potholing machine will be deployed in the Borough for 1 week in November. The locations will be a mix of Urban and Rural areas with an evaluation of its effectiveness under different scenarios.</p> <p>Microasphalt – a machine laid cold surfacing material ideally suited to application in thin layers to seal and protect existing road surfaces – we are currently in the process of identifying a number of urban and rural sites to which this material can be applied during the next financial year.</p>
Assessment of Progress (November 2023): (include explanation if required)	<p>1 – Fully Achieved</p>
Evidence of Impact (November 2023):	<p>Crack sealing represents a 75% saving on regular potholing costs (£10 per sq.m compared to £45 per sq.m). Longevity is currently being assessed but initial evaluation is indicating that it is currently lasting about the same length of time.</p> <p>Velocity patching represents a 50% saving potholing costs (£22 per sq.m compare to £45 per sq.m) with a similar lifespan. Going forward we will be</p>



**APPENDIX 1**

**PROGRESS UPDATE: Review of Highways Asset Management (inc. Potholes & Flooding)**

	<p>looking to deploy this machine onto the network in advance of the annual safety inspections to assess its impact on reducing the number of defects identified during the inspection process at this inspection point but also in 12 months time.</p> <p>Microasphalt – represents an approx. 55% saving on traditional large scale resurfacing sites (£8 per sq.m compared to £18 per sq.m) with an estimated lifespan of 8-10 years compared to 20 years. But as it is a cold applied material it does represent a significant saving on the carbon footprint of normal resurfacing.</p> <p>It must however be noted that the alternative materials and techniques being deployed are not intended to replace regular repairs methods, instead they are to be available to support and enhance the service we supply. Each techniques is relevant in its own right, but they do all have limitations on use and locality. Hence the need to have as many options available to us as possible.</p>			
<b>Assessment of Progress Gradings:</b>	<b>1</b> Fully Achieved	<b>2</b> On-Track	<b>3</b> Slipped	<b>4</b> Not Achieved

This page is intentionally left blank

## Place Select Committee Work Programme 2023-2024

Date ( <u>2pm unless stated</u> )	Topic	Attendance
<b>Monday 10 July 2023</b>	Overview Reports <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Town Centres Development</li> <li>• Environment, Leisure &amp; Green Infrastructure</li> <li>• Community Services</li> <li>• Inclusive Growth &amp; Development</li> <li>• Housing and A Fairer Stockton-on-Tees</li> </ul>	Cllr Nigel Cooke/ Cllr Clare Gamble/ Cllr Norma Stephenson OBE/ Garry Cummings/ Reuben Kench/ Ann Workman/ Carolyn Nice/ Neil Mitchell/ Craig Willows
<b>Monday 11 September 2023</b>	Scrutiny Review of Domestic Waste Collections, Kerbside Recycling and Green Waste Collections <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Scope and Project Plan</li> </ul>	Dale Rowbotham/ Craig Willows
<b>Monday 9 October 2023</b>	Scrutiny Review of Domestic Waste Collections, Kerbside Recycling and Green Waste Collections <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Evidence Gathering</li> </ul>	Dale Rowbotham/ Craig Willows/Mike Gardner
<b>Monday 13 November 2023</b>	Monitoring: Progress Update - Highways Asset Management (including Potholes and Flooding)  Scrutiny Review of Domestic Waste Collections, Kerbside Recycling and Green Waste Collections <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Evidence Gathering</li> </ul>	Ian Raine  Dale Rowbotham/ Craig Willows
<b>Thursday 30 November 2023 (12-4pm)</b>	Scrutiny Review of Domestic Waste Collections, Kerbside Recycling and Green Waste Collections <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Evidence Gathering and Site Visits</li> </ul>	Dale Rowbotham/ Craig Willows
<b>Monday 11 December 2023 (informal via Teams)</b>	Scrutiny Review of Domestic Waste Collections, Kerbside Recycling and Green Waste Collections <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Summary of Evidence / Draft Recommendations</li> </ul>	Dale Rowbotham/ Craig Willows

## Place Select Committee Work Programme 2023-2024

<b>Date (2pm unless stated)</b>	<b>Topic</b>	<b>Attendance</b>
<b>Monday 15 January 2024 (4pm)</b>	Scrutiny Review of Domestic Waste Collections, Kerbside Recycling and Green Waste Collections <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• (Draft) Final Report</li> </ul> Monitoring: Progress Update - Burial Provision (TBC)  Monitoring: Progress Update - Residents Parking Zones	Dale Rowbotham/ Craig Willows   Dale Rowbotham  Phil Hardie
<b>Monday 12 February 2024 (4pm)</b>	Overview Reports	TBC
<b>Monday 11 March 2024 (4pm)</b>		

**Remaining Monitoring Items (to be scheduled)  
Progress Updates**

- Planning (Development Management) and Adoption of Open Space